

**BEFORE THE CHRISTCHURCH REPLACEMENT  
DISTRICT PLAN HEARINGS PANEL**

**IN THE MATTER** of the Resource  
Management Act 1991  
and the Canterbury  
Earthquake  
(Christchurch  
Replacement District  
Plan) Order 2014

**AND**

**IN THE MATTER** of the Commercial  
(part) Proposal,  
Industrial (part)  
Proposal and  
Residential (part)  
Proposal of the  
proposed  
Replacement District  
Plan

---

**MEMORANDUM OF COUNSEL ON BEHALF OF CHRISTCHURCH CITY  
COUNCIL REGARDING THE NORTHERN ARTERIAL EXTENSION**

**20 JULY 2015**

---

 **Simpson Grierson**  
Barristers & Solicitors

Simpson Grierson  
J G A Winchester / S J Scott  
Telephone: +64-3-968 4018  
Facsimile: +64-3-379 5023  
Email: [sarah.scott@simpsongrierson.com](mailto:sarah.scott@simpsongrierson.com)  
PO Box 874  
SOLICITORS  
CHRISTCHURCH 8140

## **MAY IT PLEASE THE PANEL:**

1. This memorandum is filed on behalf of the Christchurch City Council (**Council**). As the Panel is aware the Council has made a decision to withdraw the funding for the Northern Arterial Extension and Cranford Street Upgrade project (**NAE** and **CSU**) from the Council's 2015-2025 Long Term Plan, and subsequently to reconsider the funding as part of the 2016/2017 Annual Plan. The purpose of this memorandum is to outline what that decision means for the evidence already filed by the Council in the Stage 1 residential and commercial/industrial hearings (including the assumptions made in that evidence about roading capacity for various re-zonings and up-zonings).
2. The resolution made by the full Council is as follows:

### ***Northern Arterial***

*That the Cranford Street northern arterial extension and 4-laning project and associated Road Of National Significance projects be removed from the Long Term Plan and be reconsidered as part of the 2016/17 Annual Plan, and at the same time that the Papanui Road and Main North Road bus priority lanes, and any required intersection safety improvements be prioritised.*

3. It is important to note that the second component of the resolution is that the funding is withdrawn for the *current* financial year, and will be reconsidered as part of the 2016/2017 Annual Plan.
4. References to the Northern Arterial Route (**NAR**) in this memorandum are to NZTA's Northern Arterial Motorway and the Council's NAE and CSU projects together. References to the NAE and CSU are to the Council's two roading projects only, both of which were subject to the Council's resolution set out above in paragraph 2.

## **UPDATE REGARDING COUNCIL MEETING – 23 JULY 2015**

5. Further to the Council's commitment to reconsider the funding as part of the 2016/2017 Annual Plan, Council officers are taking a report to the full

Council (public excluded) on 23 July 2015 that addresses the Council's commitment to the NAE and CSU projects.

6. The purpose of the report is to provide clarity around the resolution, and to address the feedback and issues that have arisen in response to the resolution. The recommendations reflect staff advice that the Council signal its commitment in principle to the works and then make provision for them in an amendment to the Long Term Plan, to be consulted on as part of the process for adopting the 2016/17 Annual Plan.

## **RESIDENTIAL EVIDENCE**

7. Mr Nilesh Redekar provided evidence at the residential hearing for the Council. His evidence addressed the likely traffic effects of the proposed rezonings to Residential Medium Density (**RMD**) as notified, and of additional RMD (ie, intensification) areas in response to the Crown's submission. The Traffic Modelling Report (by QTP) is Attachment A of Mr Redekar's evidence in chief, and the 2031 CAST model, that is the subject of Mr Redekar's evidence and the QTP Report, included an assumption that the NAE/CSU would be built by 2031.
8. Mr Redekar has completed the modelling analysis for the same land use scenarios (ie, the proposed RMD zonings as notified, and of additional RMD areas in response to the Crown's submission), but with the following amended assumptions:
  - (a) exclusion of NAE and CSU; and
  - (b) exclusion of the NAR (ie, the Northern Arterial Motorway, the NAE and the CSU).
9. In summary, the modelled effects of travel times (or delays) as a consequence of running the modelling with both set of assumptions, are generally small and similar to the previous analysis presented in Mr Redekar's evidence at the residential hearing (ie, being no greater than around 200 vpd two-way at any location). Modelled changes in peak-hour traffic volumes attributed to the RMD zonings are also small, being no

greater than around 20 vpd on a directional basis. Consequently, changes in modelled travel times (or delays) on the road network are generally minor.

## COMMERCIAL / INDUSTRIAL EVIDENCE

10. Evidence presented at the Commercial / Industrial hearing on behalf of the Council identified the following submissions on matters relating to or referencing the NAR:
  - (a) #1187 (AMP Capital Investors (New Zealand) Limited regarding the Belfast Key Activity Centre (the Styx Centre);
  - (b) #1081 (880 Main North Road Limited) and #819 (Five Blend Holdings Limited and Foxtan Properties Limited) regarding the North Belfast Outline Development Plan;
  - (c) #810 (Environ Projects Ltd and Luney Developments Ltd) and #1188 (Papanui Properties Limited) regarding the former Firestone site on Langdons Road;
  - (d) #705 (Foodstuffs South Island Limited and Foodstuffs (South Island) Properties Limited) regarding 171 Main North Road;
  - (e) #725 (Bunnings Limited) regarding the Shirley Neighbourhood Centre; and
  - (f) #686 (Silver Fern Farms) regarding part of 10 Fords Road and part of 83 Factory Road.
  
11. The transport implications of a no-build of the NAE and CSU only, and of a no-build of the NAR (if the Transport Agency was to also pull the Northern Arterial Motorway) are discussed in **Attachment A** of this memorandum.

12. In summary, Council confirms that the changes to the modelling do not affect the conclusions reached (and recommendations made in terms of submissions) in the Council's evidence as filed with the Hearings Panel and confirmed at the Commercial/Industrial hearing.

#### **IF FUNDING IS NOT PROVIDED IN THE 2016 ANNUAL PLAN UPDATE OF THE 2015 LONG TERM PLAN**

13. As indicated in paragraph 3 above, the resolution requires the Council to reconsider the funding as part of the 2016/2017 Annual Plan.
14. The Council has undertaken modelling to assess the likely impact of Council not funding construction of the NAE/CSU as part of the 2016 Annual Plan update of the 2015 Long Term Plan. This modelling has identified that the principal downstream effects from the Northern Arterial Motorway terminating at QEII Drive are increased traffic loading on the QEII Drive/Innes Road/Hills Road route to the city and on local streets around northern Mairehau as northbound traffic uses Philpotts Road to access the Northern Arterial Motorway.
15. These traffic increases will require the upgrade of several intersections and road sections to be included in future Long Term Plans. The most major impact will be the requirement to make Cranford Street four lanes.
16. The arterial corridors of Main North Road and Marshlands Road will continue to be able to provide for the additional traffic from development around Belfast and the northern suburbs. However, the Council would need to consider intersection capacity improvements to both routes in future Long Term Plans.

17. The main issue is that the above improvements have not been provided for in the 2015 Long Term Plan. However, it is likely that the major improvements referred to in paragraph 15 will not be absolutely necessary until beyond 2025 and so are outside of the scope of the 2015 Long Term Plan. Minor improvements can be accommodated by re-prioritising the current Long Term Plan projects should the need arise.

**DATED** this 20<sup>th</sup> day of July 2015



---

J G A Winchester / S J Scott  
Counsel for Christchurch City Council

**Attachment A**

**Table addressing submissions on matters relating to or referencing the NAR  
for Commercial / Industrial Proposals**

Belfast Key Activity Centre (Styx Centre)	North Belfast Development Plan	Outline	Former Firestone site on Langdons Road	171 Main North Road	Shirley Neighbourhood Centre	Silver Ferns Farm
<p><b>John Falconer's</b> evidence recommends the inclusion of rules to limit development of the Styx Centre until such time that the Northern Arterial Motorway is built.</p> <p><b>UPDATE:</b></p> <p><b>John Falconer</b> has confirmed that the conclusions reached in his evidence<sup>1</sup> remain unchanged (ie, no change in recommended inclusion of the threshold rules).</p> <p>These rules prevent development going over a certain threshold (related to a sustainable level of traffic generation), and would therefore continue to apply if the Northern Arterial Motorway designation was also pulled as a consequence of the NAE/CSU funding decision.</p>	<p>The Expert Conferencing Statement of 1 and 4 May 2015 (signed by <b>Andrew Milne</b> for Council and <b>Andrew Carr</b> and <b>Rhys Chesterman</b> on behalf of the submitters) records agreement that:</p> <p><i>No new intersection from Main North Road (state highway section) to serve the North Belfast ODP area should be available for public use until the Northern Arterial is constructed and open.</i></p> <p><b>UPDATE:</b></p> <p><b>Andrew Milne</b> has confirmed that the conclusions reached in his evidence<sup>2</sup> and in the Expert Conferencing Statement<sup>3</sup> remain unchanged.</p> <p>Further Council modelling has been undertaken, which indicated that there are negligible changes in traffic demands predicted to occur on Main North Road (along the 880 site frontage) during morning and evening peak periods as a consequence of the removal of the NAE and CSU from the NAR project.</p> <p>Some development of the site with direct left-in / left-out access to Main North Road could potentially occur without any of the NAR, but this would be subject to more detailed analysis which is already provided for by the matters for discretion as set</p>	<p>This rezoning was also addressed in the 2 April Joint Conferencing Statement, where <b>Raymond Edwards</b>, <b>Nilesh Redekar</b> and <b>Andrew Milne</b> agreed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>That the Northern Arterial needs to be in operation prior to the development of the site occurring.</i></li> <li>• <i>Traffic generation rates and likely development scenarios have been tested by the Council in the CAST model.</i></li> </ul> <p>Agreed to investigate a comparison between the <i>Operative B4/B5 zoning and the Industrial General zoning proposed as a "baseline" comparison for effects.</i></p> <p>Further work was done in order to determine whether or not this 11ha site should be rezoned from General Industrial to Commercial Retail Park.</p> <p>The Expert Conferencing Statement of 8 May 2015 (signed by <b>Andrew Milne and Mark Stevenson</b> for Council and <b>Dean Chrystal</b> and <b>Raymond Edwards</b> on behalf of the Council) then states:</p> <p><i>26. The traffic experts agree that traffic generation effects of the proposed rezoning are potentially of such significance, particularly</i></p>	<p>Rezoning from Industrial General to Commercial Core based on the existing and predicted (post NAR) poor levels of service at the Main North Road/QEII/Northcote Road intersection) was not supported in <b>Andrew Milne's</b> EIC and rebuttal.</p> <p><b>UPDATE:</b></p> <p><b>Andrew Milne</b> has confirmed that the conclusion reached in his evidence<sup>6</sup> to reject the rezoning has not changed.</p> <p>Removal of the NAE and CSU will result in additional demands on the intersection particularly on the Main North Road approaches. This would compound the poor operating conditions of the intersection</p>	<p>The traffic assessment supporting Bunning Limited's submission concludes that the critical intersection of QEII/Marshland Road would experience an increase of some 30-50 new vehicle movements during the evening peak hour.</p> <p><b>UPDATE:</b></p> <p><b>Andrew Milne</b> has confirmed that the conclusion reached in his evidence<sup>7</sup> to support the rezoning has not changed.</p> <p>Further Council modelling has been undertaken with the NAE and CSU removed, which indicates that delay on the northbound approach to the intersection would increase from 40 seconds per vehicle with the full NAR to 75 seconds per vehicle with the exclusion of the NAE and CSU, therefore tipping the approach from an acceptable LOS (D) to a poor LOS (F) during peak evening periods.</p> <p>However, given the relatively low level of new peak hour trip generation associated with the change, <b>Andrew Milne</b> considers that the effects of the additional vehicle trips associated would be indiscernible from the variation in</p>	<p><b>Bridget O'Brien's</b> evidence<sup>8</sup> recognised that a small part of the area sought for re-zoning by Silver Fern Farms (part of 10 Fords Road and part of 83 Factory Road) is to the east of the Northern Arterial Motorway (on Planning Map 12). Her evidence was that to provide a wastewater service for this area would require a duct under the Northern Arterial Motorway, and that the expense (likely to be over \$50,000) of providing a wastewater service to these areas was not warranted, given the small area that would be serviced. <b>Bridget O'Brien</b> concluded that unless Silver Fern Farms were to pay for providing a wastewater service for the area, that she did not support extending the zoning beyond what is already proposed as Industrial.</p> <p>In terms of the other part of the area subject to Silver Ferns Farm's submission (apart from the area to the east of the Northern Arterial designation), <b>Bridget O'Brien's</b> evidence was that provided that wastewater flows and volumes do not increase beyond the current trade waste discharge consent, re-zoning of the Silver Fern Farms properties from Industrial General to Industrial Heavy is acceptable from a wastewater perspective.<sup>9</sup></p>	

1 John Falconer evidence in chief, paragraph 3.3.

2 Andrew Milne evidence in chief, paragraphs 6.28 to 6.31.

3 Expert Conferencing Statement (Traffic & Transport), 2 April 2015, Issue 6.

4 Andrew Milne evidence in chief, paragraph 6.107.

5 Andrew Milne evidence in chief, paragraph 6.122.

6 Bridget O'Brien evidence in chief, paragraph 9.5.

7 Bridget O'Brien evidence in chief, paragraph 9.6.

8 Bridget O'Brien evidence in chief, paragraph 9.6.

9 Bridget O'Brien evidence in chief, paragraph 9.6.

Belfast Key Activity Centre (Styx Centre)	North Belfast Development Plan	Outline	Former Firestone site on Langdons Road	171 Main North Road	Shirley Neighbourhood Centre	Silver Ferris Farm
	out in the Expert Conferencing Statement.		<p>at peak periods, to warrant limiting the permitted level of generation from the site under the proposed CRP zone to 950 vehicle trips per hour during the Thursday pm peak hour period. The 950 vehicles per hour limit is based on the understanding that this level of traffic generation may be generated as a permitted activity under the pRDP Industrial General zoning using the subdivision scenario described in paragraph 22 above.</p> <p>27. The planning experts (Mr Stevenson and Mr Chrystal) agree that subject to specific rules for the site relating to traffic generation and office development the Commercial Retail Park zoning is appropriate for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ...</li> <li>• <i>The traffic generation rule is a practical means of ensuring that development beyond a certain level is able to be assessed as to its impacts on the network at peak times.</i></li> </ul> <p><b>Andrew Milne</b> has confirmed that the reference to the "Northern Arterial" in the 2 April Joint Conferencing Statement, should be interpreted as the Northern Arterial Motorway only.</p> <p><b>UPDATE:</b></p> <p><b>Andrew Milne and Mark Stevenson</b> have confirmed that the conclusions reached in their evidence<sup>4</sup> and in the Expert</p>		<p>traffic flows experienced on a day-to-day basis on an arterial route.</p>	<p><b>UPDATE:</b></p> <p>Bridget O'Brien has confirmed that the conclusion reached in her evidence to not support the rezoning of part of 10 Fords Road and part of 83 Factory Road to the east of the Northern Arterial Motorway, remains unchanged.</p> <p>She confirms that her evidence relates only to the Northern Arterial Motorway (not the NAE/CSU).</p> <p>If the NAR project is cancelled altogether, Bridget O'Brien has confirmed that she would have no objection to the area to the East of the Northern Arterial being rezoned as Industrial Heavy, providing that wastewater flows and volumes do not increase beyond the current trade waste discharge consent.</p>



Belfast Key Activity Centre (Styx Centre)	North Belfast Development Plan	Former Firestone site on Langdons Road	171 Main North Road	Shirley Neighbourhood Centre	Silver Ferns Farm
		<p>Conferecing Statement<sup>5</sup> remain unchanged.</p> <p>As the NAR offered only some additional capacity to the section of Main North Road (between Harewood and Cranford Streets) which was predicted to operate close to capacity, the removal of the NAE and CSU makes little difference to the operation of this section of Main North Road (ie, the section of Main North Road most directly impacted by the re-zoning). Instead the likely impacts of removing the NAE and CSU in relation to the development of the site is simply to compound predicted additional side road delay and more use of the local road network commensurate to the loss in capacity along Main North Road.</p>			